



## STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION STAFF LEGISLATIVE BILL ANALYSIS

Date Introduced:	<b>02/23/01</b>	Bill No:	<b>AB 893</b>
Tax:	<b>Sales and Use</b>	Author:	<b>B. Campbell</b>
Board Position:		Related Bills:	<b>AB 1427 (Nation)</b>

### BILL SUMMARY

This bill would exempt from sales and use taxes the sales of snack foods through a vending machine until January 1, 2008.

### ANALYSIS

#### Current Law

Under existing law, a sales tax is imposed on retailers for the privilege of selling tangible personal property in this state. The use tax is imposed upon the storage, use, or other consumption of tangible personal property purchased in this state. Either the sales tax or the use tax applies with respect to all sales or purchases of tangible personal property, unless that property is specifically exempted. Section 6359 of the Revenue and Taxation Code provides an exemption for sales of food products, except when sold under the following circumstances:

- 1) When food products are served as meals on or off the premises of the retailer.
- 2) When the food products are furnished, prepared, or served for consumption at tables, chairs, or counters or from trays, glasses, dishes, or other tableware whether provided by the retailer or by a person with whom the retailer contracts to furnish, prepare, or serve food products to others.
- 3) When the food products are ordinarily sold for immediate consumption on or near a location at which parking facilities are provided primarily for the use of patrons in consuming the products purchased at the location, even though those products are sold on a "take out" or "to go" order and are actually packaged or wrapped and taken from the premises of the retailer.
- 4) When the food products are sold for consumption within a place, the entrance to which is subject to an admission charge, except national and state parks and monuments, marinas, campgrounds, and recreational vehicle parks.
- 5) When the food products are sold through a vending machine (but limited by Section 6359.2).
- 6) When the food products sold are furnished in a form suitable for consumption on the seller's premises, and both of the following apply:
  - a) Over 80 percent of the seller's gross receipts are from the sale of food products.

*This staff analysis is provided to address various administrative, cost, revenue and policy issues; it is not to be construed to reflect or suggest the Board's formal position.*

b) Over 80 percent of the seller's retail sales of food products are subject to tax.

7) When the food products are sold as hot prepared food products.

Current law, however, also provides through Section 6359.2 that only 33 percent of the gross receipts from the retail sale of food products are subject to tax when sold through a vending machine.

### **Proposed Law**

This bill would amend Sections 6359 and 6359.2 of the Sales and Use Tax Law to provide that sales of snack foods through a vending machine are exempt from tax until January 1, 2008.

This bill would also define the term "snack foods" to mean cookies, crackers, chips, snack cakes and pies, pastries, pretzels, granola snacks, popcorn, fabricated chips and snacks, trail mix, nuts, edible seeds, dried fruit snacks, meat snacks, and snack mixtures. Except for popcorn, snack foods would only include items that are sold in a condition suitable for consumption without further processing, including, but not limited to, cooking, heating, or thawing.

The bill would become operative on the first day of the calendar quarter commencing more than 90 days after the bill is enacted. The provisions of this bill would remain in effect until January 1, 2008, and as of that date would be repealed.

### **In General**

Sales of cold food products are generally exempt from tax. When food is sold for consumption at facilities provided by the retailer, however, the sale is taxable. In the case of vending machine sales, the retailer is unable to determine if the food is consumed on the premises where the vending machine is located. Accordingly, in order to minimize the vending machine operators' reporting problems, a standard approximation of the amount of food consumed at the vending machine site was established. Section 6359.2 provides that 67 percent of cold food products sold through vending machines are exempt from tax and that 33 percent of cold food products are considered to be consumed at facilities of the retailer and are therefore taxable.

### **Background**

In 1983, Section 6359.2 was repealed and 100 percent of the gross receipts from the sales of cold food products through vending machines were taxable.

Section 6359.2 was added again in 1988 to provide a partial exemption for cold food products sold through vending machines. Due to revenue considerations, the exemption was phased in during 1988 and 1989. During 1988, 77 percent of the gross receipts from the sales of food products sold through vending machines were subject to tax. During 1989, 55 percent of the gross receipts from the sales of food products sold through vending machines were subject to tax. Beginning in 1990 and effective thereafter, 33 percent of the gross receipts from the sales of food products sold through vending machines were subject to tax.

Provisions similar to this bill were contained in Assembly Bill 890 (Floyd), introduced in the 1999 Legislative Session. That measure failed to pass in the Assembly. *This staff analysis is provided to address various administrative, cost, revenue and policy issues; it is not to be construed to reflect or suggest the Board's formal position.*

Appropriations Committee. Similar provisions were also contained in AB 2824 (Cardoza), introduced during the 2000 Legislative Session. AB 2824 was held in the Assembly Revenue and Taxation Committee. The Board voted to support both AB 890 and AB 2824.

## COMMENTS

1. **Sponsor and Purpose.** According to the author's office, who is also the sponsor of the bill, the purpose of this measure is to create an exemption for sales of snack food and candy sold through vending machines so that the same exemption applies to sales of these products as sold by other retailers, such as grocery stores.
2. **Definition of "snack food."** This bill defines the term snack food to mean "cookies, crackers, chips, snack cakes and pies, pastries, pretzels, granola snacks, popcorn, fabricated chips and snacks, trail mix, nuts, edible seeds, dried fruit snacks, meat snacks, and snack mixtures. Except for popcorn, snack foods would include only items that are sold in a condition suitable for consumption without further processing such as cooking, heating, or thawing." Sales of bulk items (e.g., handful of nuts, candy, or gum) are not included in the proposed exemption.
3. **Sales of carbonated beverages would still be subject to tax.** Since carbonated beverages are not included in the definition of food products or snack food products, sales of carbonated beverages would still be subject to tax when sold through a vending machine, consistent with sales by other retailers.
4. **How much snack food is consumed on the premises?** The purpose of the bill is to create equal tax treatment between vending machine operators selling candy and snack food and other retailers selling the same products, such as convenience stores. The purpose for taxing 33 percent of the gross receipts of vending machine sales is to tax the approximate amount of products consumed on the premises of the vending machine. According to the California Automatic Vendor's Council, the percentage of candy and snack food consumed on the premises is very small, and therefore, should be exempted from the computation of tax. Since these items are packaged goods, they are more likely to be taken elsewhere for consumption by the purchaser. Other types of food items sold through vending machines, such as cold sandwiches and fruit, are more likely to be consumed on the premises, and 33 percent of the gross receipts from the sales of these products would still be subject to tax under this bill.
5. **Bill could make reporting for vending machine operators more difficult.** Under current law, vending machine operators must segregate their sales between food products and non-food products. Currently, 33 percent of the gross receipts from the sale of food products are subject to tax, and 100 percent of the gross receipts from the sale of non-food products are subject to tax. This bill will create a third category of items, snack foods, that vending machine operators must segregate in their records. This could further complicate reporting for vending machine operators and could lead to additional reporting errors.

*This staff analysis is provided to address various administrative, cost, revenue and policy issues; it is not to be construed to reflect or suggest the Board's formal position.*

- 6. Proposition 163 does not appear to affect this bill.** In 1992, voters passed Proposition 163, which, among other things, repealed the “snack tax” law. The snack tax was repealed by amending Section 6359 to include snack food items within the definition of food products. Additionally, Section 34 was added to Article XIII of the California Constitution to prohibit the State of California from levying a sales or use tax on the sale of food products for human consumption, except as provided by statute as of the effective date of that section.

Article II, Section 10(c) provides that an initiative statute may be amended by the Legislature without a vote of the people only if the initiative statute so provides. Commonly, language is included in the initiative statute that the Legislature may amend the statute without voter approval only if the proposed amendment furthers the purposes of the initiative. While the language of Proposition 163 did not contain this formula, Section Four of the initiative provides that Section 34 supersedes all other Constitutional provisions in conflict with it. Section 34 only prohibits the levying of a new tax on sales of food but does not prohibit the granting of a new exemption. Since this bill would grant a new exemption and further the purposes of the initiative statute – to limit sales and use taxes on sales of food products – a reasonable interpretation of Section 34 is to permit such amendment without voter approval. As a result, voter approval is not needed to enact the amendment proposed by this bill.

Since tax upon the sale of food products for human consumption through a vending machine was included in Section 6359 at the time Proposition 163 was passed, it appears that repeal of this exemption and reinstatement of the tax on sales through a vending machine would not be in violation of Section 34.

- 7. Related Legislation.** Assembly Bill 1427 (Nation) contains provisions similar to this bill, with the exception of the January 1, 2008 sunset date.

## **COST ESTIMATE**

Some costs would be incurred in notifying affected retailers, answering inquiries, and amending appropriate regulations. A detailed cost estimate of the workload impacting data entry, verification, and return processing is pending.

## **REVENUE ESTIMATE**

### **Background, Methodology, and Assumptions**

There are two sources of information regarding national sales through vending machines; the magazine *Vending Times* in their Census of the Industry issue, published in August 2000 and the magazine *Automatic Merchandiser* in their annual State of the Vending Industry Report, published in August of 2000. National sales of items that would be subject to the provisions of this bill were estimated by *Vending Times* to be \$4,962.0 million, and by *Automatic Merchandiser* to be \$3,607.2 million. Averaging these two figures gives an estimate of \$4,284.6 million.

*This staff analysis is provided to address various administrative, cost, revenue and policy issues; it is not to be construed to reflect or suggest the Board’s formal position.*

The National Automatic Merchandising Association (NAMA) has stated that California does not account for 12% of these sales. They state that vending machines derive a large portion of their business from manufacturing locations, and California is more of a service economy that does not have as extensive a manufacturing base as other states. According to the Mars Candy Company, only 7% of their vend-candy sales are to California vending machine firms.

Using national estimates for vending machine sales and assuming that California accounts for 7% of these sales, estimated sales subject to the provisions of this bill would be as follows:

	1999 Sales <u>(millions)</u>
Snack Food and Bottled Water Sales Through Vending Machines	\$ 4,284.6
California Percent of Cold Food Products	7%
California Sales of Cold Food Products	\$ 299.9
Percent Currently Taxable	33%
Sales Exempted by AB 893	\$ 99.0

According to both *Vending Times* and *Automatic Merchandiser*, vending machine sales have increased by about 5% during each of the past two years. If we assume that sales will increase by 5% per year, then estimated 2002 sales subject to the provisions of this bill would amount to \$114.6 million.

### Revenue Summary

The annual revenue loss from exempting \$114.6 million in sales of snack food and bottled water through vending machines from the sales and use tax would be as follows:

	<u>Revenue Loss</u>
State loss (5%)	\$ 5.7 million
Local loss (2.25%)	2.6 million
Transit loss (0.67%)	<u>0.8 million</u>
Total	<u><u>\$ 9.1 million</u></u>

Analysis prepared by:	Bradley E. Miller	445-6662	03/19/01
Revenue estimate by:	David E. Hayes	445-0840	
Contact:	Margaret S. Shedd	322-2376	

*This staff analysis is provided to address various administrative, cost, revenue and policy issues; it is not to be construed to reflect or suggest the Board's formal position.*